

Julie L. To (SBN 219482) Department of Real Estate 320 West 4th Street, Suite. 350 Los Angeles, California 90013-1105

Telephone: (213) 576-6916 (direct) (213) 576-6982 (office)

5

1

2

3

4

6 7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF REAL ESTATE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Accusation of No. H-05135 SD DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC; **ACCUSATION** and JOYCE THERESA THOMAS,

Respondents.

The Complainant, Veronica Kilpatrick, a Supervising Special Investigator of the State of California, for cause of Accusation against DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC and JOYCE THERESA THOMAS (collectively, "Respondents"), alleges as follows:

1.

The Complainant, Veronica Kilpatrick, a Supervising Special Investigator of the State of California, makes this Accusation in her official capacity.

DRE Accusation - Dave Stubbs Real Estate Inc & Joyce Theresa Thomas

10

9

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

2425

26

27

All references to the "Code" are to the California Business and Professions Code and all references to "Regulations" are to Title 10, Chapter 6, California Code of Regulations.

DEPARTMENT OF REAL ESTATE LICENSE HISTORY

3.

DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC

- A. Respondent DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC ("DSREI") is presently licensed and/or has license rights under the Real Estate Law (Part 1 of Division 4 of the Code) as a real estate broker (corporation) ("REC"), DRE license ID 00618102.
 - B. DSREI was originally licensed by the DRE on or about December 16, 1977.
- C. According to the DRE's records, DSREI's current designated officer ("D.O.") is real estate broker ("REB") Christopher Alan Moore ("Moore") (DRE license ID 01771207) until his officer expiration date of December 15, 2021. Prior to Moore, DSREI's D.O. was JOYCE THERESA THOMAS, until her officer affiliation was cancelled as of September 5, 2019.
 - D. DSREI's DRE license will expire on December 15, 2021.

5.

JOYCE THERESA THOMAS

- A. Respondent JOYCE THERESA THOMAS ("THOMAS") is presently licensed and/or has license rights under the Real Estate Law (Part 1 of Division 4 of the Code) as a REB, DRE license ID 01348393.
- B. THOMAS was originally licensed by the DRE as a RES on or about August 21, 2002, and as a REB on or about January 4, 2018.
- C. According to the DRE's records, THOMAS was the D.O. of DSREI until her officer affiliation was cancelled as of September 5, 2019.

D. THOMAS' DRE license will expire on January 3, 2022.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF THE REAL ESTATE LAW

Trust Fund Handling -

Code Section 10145 and Regulations 2831, 2831.1, 2831.2, 2832.1, and 2834

6.

Pursuant to Code Section 10145 Handling of Trust Funds (selected portions):

"(a)(1): A real estate broker who accepts funds belonging to others in connection with a transaction subject to this part shall deposit all those funds that are not immediately placed into a neutral escrow depository or into the hands of the broker's principal, into a trust fund account maintained by the broker in a bank or recognized depository in this state. All funds deposited by the broker in a trust account shall be maintained there until disbursed by the broker in accordance with instructions from the person entitled to the funds.

- (2) Withdrawals may be made from a trust fund account of an individual broker only upon the signature of that broker, or in the case of a corporate broker, only upon the signature of an officer through whom the corporation is licensed pursuant to Section 10158 or 10211, or one, or more, of the following persons if specifically authorized in writing by the individual broker or officer:
 - (A) A real estate salesperson licensed to the broker.
 - (B) Another broker acting pursuant to a written agreement with the individual broker that conforms to the requirements of this part and any regulations promulgated pursuant to this part.
 - (C) An unlicensed employee of the individual broker, if the broker has fidelity bond coverage equal to at least the maximum amount of the trust funds to which the unlicensed employee has access at any time. For

purposes of this section, bonds providing coverage may be written with a deductible of up to 5 percent of the coverage amount. For bonds with a deductible, the employing broker shall have evidence of financial responsibility that is sufficient to protect members of the public against a loss subject to the deductible amount.

Evidence of financial responsibility shall include one or more of the following:

- (i) Separate fidelity bond coverage adequate to cover the amount of the fidelity bond deductible.
- (ii) A cash deposit held in a separate account, apart from other funds of the broker, the broker's employees, or the broker's principals, in a bank or recognized depository in this state adequate to cover the amount of the fidelity bond deductible and held exclusively and solely for the purpose of paying the fidelity bond deductible amount.
- (iii) Any other evidence of financial responsibility approved by the commissioner.
- (3) An arrangement under which a person enumerated in subparagraph (A),(B), or (C) of paragraph (2) is authorized to make withdrawals from a trust fund account of a broker shall not relieve an individual broker, nor the broker-officer of a corporate broker licensee, from responsibility or liability as provided by law in handling trust funds in the broker's custody.

25

26

1.3

- (b) For each bank account which contains trust funds, a record of all trust funds received and disbursed shall be maintained in accordance with subdivision (a) or (c).
- (c) Maintenance of journals of account cash receipts and disbursements, or similar records, or automated data processing systems, including computer systems and electronic storage and manipulation of information and documents, in accordance with generally accepted accounting principles, shall constitute compliance with subdivision (a) provided that such journals, records, or systems contain the elements required by subdivision (a) and that such elements are maintained in a format that will readily enable tracing and reconciliation in accordance with Section 2831.2.
- (d) Nothing in this section shall be construed to permit a violation of Section 10145 of the Code.
- (e) A broker is not required to keep records pursuant to this section of checks which are written by a principal, given to the broker and made payable to third parties for the provision of services, including but not limited to escrow, credit and appraisal services, when the total amount of such checks for any transaction from that principal does not exceed \$1,000. Upon request of the Department or the maker of such checks, a broker shall account for the receipt and distribution of such checks. A broker shall retain for three years copies of receipts issued or obtained in connection with the receipt and distribution of such checks."

8.

Pursuant to Regulation 2831.1 Separate Record for Each Beneficiary or Transaction:

"(a) A broker shall keep a separate record for each beneficiary or transaction, accounting for all funds which have been deposited to the broker's trust bank account and interest, if any, earned on the funds on deposit. The record shall include information sufficient to

1	reconciliation, the account number or name of the principals or beneficiaries or transactions, and
2	the trust fund liabilities of the broker to each of the principals, beneficiaries or transactions."
3	10.
4	Pursuant to Regulation 2832.1 Trust Fund Handling for Multiple Beneficiaries:
5	"The written consent of every principal who is an owner of the funds in the
6	account shall be obtained by a real estate broker prior to each disbursement if such a
7	disbursement will reduce the balance of funds in the account to an amount less than the existing
8	aggregate trust fund liability of the broker to all owners of the funds."
9	11.
LO	Pursuant to Regulation 2834 Trust Account Withdrawals:
11	"(a) Withdrawals may be made from a trust fund account of an individual broker
L2	only upon the signature of the broker or one or more of the following persons if specifically
L3	authorized in writing by the broker:
1.4	(1) a salesperson licensed to the broker.
.5	(2) a person licensed as a broker who has entered into a written agreement
16	pursuant to Section 2726 with the broker.
.7	(3) an unlicensed employee of the broker with fidelity bond coverage at least
18	equal to the maximum amount of the trust funds to which the employee
.9	has access at any time.
0.	(b) Withdrawals may be made from the trust fund account of a corporate broker
1	only upon the signature of:
2	(1) an officer through whom the corporation is licensed pursuant to Section
3	10158 or 10211 of the Code or
4	(2) one of the persons enumerated in paragraph (1), (2) or (3) of subdivision
5	(a) above, provided that specific authorization in writing is given by the officer through whom
.6 !7	
' [[

Pursuant to Regulation 2752 Notice of Change of Broker:

"Whenever a real estate salesperson enters the employ of a real estate broker, the broker shall notify the commissioner of that fact within five days. This notification shall be given on a form prepared by the Bureau and shall be signed by the broker and the salesperson. The form of notification shall provide for the furnishing of at least the following information:

13.

- (1) Name and business address of the broker.
- (2) Mailing address of the salesperson, if different from the business address.
- (3) Date when the salesperson entered the employ of the broker.
- (4) Certification by the salesperson that he has complied with the provisions of Section 10161.8(d) of the Business and Professions Code.
- (5) Name and business address of the real estate broker to whom the salesperson was last licensed and the date of termination of that relationship.
- (6) Certification by the salesperson that the predecessor broker has notice of the termination of the relationship.

As an acceptable alternative to (5) and (6) above, the form may be utilized by the predecessor broker to give notice of the termination of the broker/salesperson relationship as required by Section 10161.8(b) of the Business and Professions Code if this notice is mailed to the commissioner not more than ten days following such termination."

Broker Supervision - Code Section 10159.2 and Regulation 2725

14.

Pursuant to Code Section 10159.2 Responsibility of Corporate Officer in Charge:

"(a) The officer designated by a corporate broker licensee pursuant to Section 10211 shall be responsible for the supervision and control of the activities conducted on behalf

1.	The form and extent of such policies, rules, procedures and systems shall take into		
2	consideration the number of salespersons employed and the number and location of branch		
3	offices.		
4	A broker shall establish a system for monitoring compliance with such policies,		
5	rules, procedures and systems. A broker may use the services of brokers and salespersons to		
6	assist in administering the provisions of this section so long as the broker does not relinquish		
7	overall responsibility for supervision of the acts of salespersons licensed to the broker."		
8	Further Grounds for Disciplinary Action - Code Section 10177		
9	16.		
10	Pursuant to Code Section 10177, "The commissioner may suspend or revoke the		
11	license of a real estate licensee, delay the renewal of a license of a real estate licensee, or deny the		
12	issuance of a license to an applicant, who has done any of the following:		
13			
14	(d) Willfully disregarded or violated the Real Estate Law (Part 1 (commencing		
15	with Section 10000)) or Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 11000) of Part 2 or the rules and		
16	regulations of the commissioner for the administration and enforcement of the Real Estate Law		
17	and Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 11000) of Part 2."		
18	•••		
19	(g) Demonstrated negligence or incompetence in performing an act for which he		
20	or she is required to hold a license"		
21	/// · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
22	/// ·		
23	<i> </i>		
24	<i>///</i>		
25	///		
26			
27			

DRE AUDIT SD 180029: DAVE STUBBS REAL ESATE INC PROPERTY MANAGEMENT & VACATION RENTAL ACTIVITY

17.

On September 17, 2019, the DRE completed its audit examinations of the books and records of Respondent DSREI pertaining to its property management and vacation rental activity (SD 180029), which require a real estate license, pursuant to Code Section 10131(b). The audit examination covered a period of time beginning on April 1, 2018 and ending on March 31, 2019 ("audit examination period" or "audit period"), and was performed between April 25, 2019 and July 17, 2019. The final report of September 27, 2019 revealed violations of the Code and the Regulations as set forth in the following paragraphs, and more fully discussed in the Audit Report Transmittal and Report for SD 180029.

18.

Corporate Structure of DSREI

According to DSREI's D.O. THOMAS, the corporate structure and ownership for

DSREI as of April 25, 2019 was as follows:

Name	Title	License	Shareholder Percentage
THOMAS	President	D.O./REB	0 %
Jeffrey Dunham	CEO	N/A	0%
Judith Stubbs	Treasurer	RES, DRE ID 00520087	0 %
Karen Dunham	Director/Board Member	N/A	0 %
Stubbs Family Trust (Judith & David Stubbs)		N/A	100 %

///

24 ||

25 |

1.3

DSREI's Property Management and Vacation Rental Activities

A. According to THOMAS and the records examined for the DRE audit examination, as of March 31, 2019, DSREI managed sixty-five (65) single family residences for fifty-seven (57) owners, and eighty-four (84) vacation rentals for eighty-six (86) owners (there are two owners for two of the vacation rentals), and during the audit examination period deposited \$2,478,931 in trust funds into Trust Account ######0093 ("TA1"). Based on bank statements, during the audit examination period, there was a total deposit of \$2,916,273 into Trust Account ######0085 ("TA2"). DSREI charged a management fee of 8% and a leasing fee of 50% of the first month's rent related to property management and 25% of the total lease amount for vacation rentals. For tenant placement service with no month-to-month management, DSREI charged 6% of the entire rent for the lease term. Late fees collected from tenants are paid to the property owners and non-sufficient funds fees collected from tenants are paid to DSREI.

B. DSREI utilized Escapia software for its vacation rental activity. According to THOMAS and employee Bo Dunham, there were eight (8) vacation rentals that required a lease of more than thirty (30) days; approximately 78 of the vacation rental properties were leased for seven (7) to thirty (30) days, and typically the vacation properties had a three- to four-month tenancy during the winter season. The busiest season was summer. Vacation rentals were typically furnished 1400 square feet condominiums with two (2) bedrooms.

C. DSREI utilized Buildium property management software since 2008 for its residential property management activity, with a different property code for each property. According to THOMAS, as of March 31, 2019, there were a total of five (5) property managers who managed the sixty-five single family residences.

D. According to THOMAS, DSREI also performed residential and commercial resale activity, representing both buyers and sellers, and during the audit period, closed twenty-three

1	(23) transactions totaling \$23,956,000 in which one was a dual agency transaction. DSREI's		
2	resale activity was not included in Audit SD 180029.		
3	20.		
4	Trust Accounts		
5	During the audit period, DSREI maintained two (2) trust accounts for multiple		
6	beneficiaries for handling the receipts and disbursements of trust funds in connection with its		
7	property management and short term leases (vacation rentals) activity:		
8	Trust Account 1 - Account ######0093 ("TA1")		
9	Bank: Pacific Premier Bank, 781 Garden View Ct., Ste. 100, Encinitas CA 92024		
10	Signatories: THOMAS, Judith L. Stubbs (DRE license ID 00520087), Judith		
11	Jacobson (DRE license ID 01322888), David W. Stubbs (DRE license ID		
12	00232729; not listed as DSREI's REB associate), and Timothy G. Hart (DRE		
13	license ID 00429674; not listed as DSREI's REB associate).		
14	Date of Bank Reconciliation: as of March 31, 2019		
15	During the audit period, DSREI maintained TA1 for handling the receipts and disbursements of		
16	trust funds in connection with its property management activities, including rents and security		
17	deposits collected from tenants, and payments for property-related expenses, owner remittances		
18	and management fees to DSREI. One (1) signature was required. Jacobson usually signed the		
19	checks; some checks were signed by D.O. THOMAS. Based on the images examined of the		
20	approximately 177 checks cleared between December 1, 2018 and March 31, 2019, 150 checks		
21	were signed by Jacobson and 25 by THOMAS.		
22	<i>///</i>		
23	///		
24	<i>///</i>		
25	///		
26			
27			

<u>Trust Account 2 - Account ######0085 ("TA2")</u>

Bank: Pacific Premier Bank, 781 Garden View Ct., Ste. 100, Encinitas CA 92024 Signatories: THOMAS, Judith L. Stubbs (DRE license ID 00520087), Judith Jacobson (DRE license ID 01322888), David W. Stubbs (DRE license ID 00232729; not listed as DSREI's REB associate), and Timothy G. Hart (DRE license ID 00429674; not listed as DSREI's REB associate).

Date of Bank Reconciliation: as of March 31, 2019

During the audit period, DSREI maintained TA2 for handling the receipts and disbursements of trust funds in connection with its short term leases (vacation rentals) activities, including rents, security deposits, reservation fees, cleaning fees, transient occupancy taxes, damage insurance, and travel insurance collected from tenants, and payments for property-related expenses, owner remittances and management fees to DSREI. One (1) signature was required. Based on the check images examined, most were signed by THOMAS.

AUDIT FINDINGS: VIOLATIONS OF THE REAL ESTATE LAW BY DSREI

21.

In the course of property management activities described above in Paragraph 19 and during the audit examination period described in Paragraph 17, Respondent DSREI violated the Code and the Regulations, as described below:

22.

<u>Handling of Trust Funds; Trust Fund Handling for Multiple Beneficiaries</u> (Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2832.1)

A. As of March 31, 2019, there was a minimum trust fund shortage of <\$32,592.89> in TA1, caused by negative property balances totaling <\$32,592.89>, of which <\$1,233.00> was related to an active property, and <\$31,359.89> was related to inactive properties which did not have any posted transactions since at least April 1, 2018. DSREI

25

26

27

identify the transaction and the parties to the transaction as they related to the funds collected

1	from tenants and deposited into TA1, in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation		
2	2831.1.		
3	B. DSREI's separate record for each beneficiary or transaction maintained for		
4	TA2 was inadequate. There was no tenant record that provided all the categories combined into		
5	one record with the following information in chronological sequence: date and amount of		
6	deposit' date, check/reference number, and amount of disbursement; and the balance after		
7	posting transactions on any date, in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2831.1.		
8	Additionally, there was no separate record for the unidentified/unaccounted for funds of		
9	\$16,918.63 in TA2 as of March 31, 2019, in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation		
10	2831.1.		
11	25.		
12	Handling of Trust Funds; Trust Account Reconciliation		
13	(Code Section 10145(a) and Regulation 2831.2)		
14	A. During the audit period, DSREI failed to properly perform a monthly		
15	reconciliation comparing the balance of all separate records to the balance of the control record		
16	for TA1, in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2831.2.		
17	B. During the audit period, DSREI failed to properly perform a monthly		
18	reconciliation comparing the balance of all separate records to the balance of the control record		
19	for TA2, in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2831.2.		
20	C. DSREI failed to reconcile the unidentified/unaccounted for funds of		
21	\$16,918.63 held in TA2 as of March 31, 2019, in violation of Code Section 10145 and		
22	Regulation 2831.2.		
23	///		
24	/// · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
25	/ //		
26			
27			

Handling of Trust Funds; Trust Account Withdrawals (Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2834)

A. According to the bank signature card examined, REB David Wilbur Stubbs and REB Tim Hart were allowed to make withdrawals from TA1 since at least June 27, 2013. DRE was notified of their association with DSREI effective January 1, 2018.

B. According to the bank signature card examined, REB David Wilbur Stubbs and REB Tim Hart were allowed to make withdrawals from TA2 since at least June 27, 2013. DRE was notified of their association with DSREI effective January 1, 2018. DSREI's allowance of David Wilbur Stubbs and Tim Hart to make withdrawals from TA1 between June 27, 2013 and December 31, 2017 is in violation of **Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2834**.

C. RES Judith Lynn Stubbs and RES Judith M. Jacobson were allowed to make withdrawals from TA1 since at least June 27, 2013; approximately 150 of the 177 checks that were disbursed from TA1 between December 1, 2018 and March 31, 2019 were signed by Jacobson.

D. DSREI's allowance of David Wilbur Stubbs, Time Hart, Judith Stubbs, and Judith Jacobson to be signatories on TA1 and TA2 without written authorization by THOMAS is in violation of Code Section 10145 and Regulation 2834.

27.

Salesperson and Broker Associate Retention and Termination; Notice of Change of Broker (Code Section 10161.8 and Regulation 2752)

A. DSREI did not timely notify the DRE of the affiliation of REB associates Tim Hart, David Wilbur Stubbs, and Michael Rhea Dyer (DRE license ID 00931919), in violation of Code Section 10161.8 and Regulation 2752.

DRE Accusation - Dave Stubbs Real Estate Inc & Joyce Theresa Thomas

	1)
1	B. DSREI did not timely notify the DRE of the termination of employment of
2	RES Christopher Robin Crutchfield (DRE license ID 02013833) and RES Marilyn Jean Capra
3	(DRE license ID 01485332), in violation of Code Section 10161.8 and Regulation 2752.
4	28.
5	Responsibility of Corporate Officer in Charge/Broker Supervision
6	(Code Sections 10159.2 and 10177(h) and Regulation 2725)
7	Based on the findings, as described in Paragraphs 22 through 27, D.O. THOMAS
8	failed to exercise reasonable supervision and control of the real estate activities of DSREI's
9	licensees and employees to secure full compliance with the Real Estate Laws and Regulations, in
10	violation of Code Sections 10159.2 and 10177(h) and Regulation 2725.
11	29.
12	Additional Violations of the Real Estate Law
13	The overall conduct of Respondents DSREI and THOMAS is violative of the Real
14	Estate Law and constitutes cause for the suspension or revocation of their real estate licenses and
15	license rights under the provisions of Code Section 10177(g) for negligence and Code Section
16	10177(d) for willful disregard of the Real Estate Law.
17	COSTS
18	Investigation and Enforcement Costs
19	30.
20	Code Section 10106 provides, in pertinent part, that in any order issued in
21	resolution of a disciplinary proceeding before the Department of Real Estate, the Commissioner
22	may request the administrative law judge to direct a licensee found to have committed a violation
23	of this part to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement
24	of the case.
25	///
36	
,,	

Audit Costs

31.

Code Section 10148(b) provides, in pertinent part, the Commissioner shall charge a real estate broker for the cost of any audit, if the Commissioner has found in a final decision following a disciplinary hearing that the broker has violated Code section 10145 or a regulation or rule of the Commissioner interpreting said section. WHEREFORE, Complainant prays that a hearing be conducted on the allegations of this Accusation and that upon proof thereof, a decision be rendered imposing disciplinary action against the licenses and license rights of Respondents DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC and JOYCE THERESA THOMAS under the Real Estate Law (Part 1 of vision 4 of the Business and Professions Code), for the cost of investigation and enforcement as permitted by law, and for such other and further relief as may be proper under other provisions of law, and for costs of audit.

Dated at San Diego, California

March day of , 2020.

DAVE STUBBS REAL ESTATE INC

Enforcement – J. Hafen, V. Kilpatrick

JOYCE THERESA THOMAS

Audits – J. Borromeo, J. Lin

Supervising Special Investigator

20

cc:

Sacto.

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

23

24

25

26

27

DRE Accusation - Dave Stubbs Real Estate Inc & Joyce Theresa Thomas